

POSC 283: Separatist Movements

Carleton College, Fall 2020



Professor Devashree Gupta

404 Willis Hall

Phone: x4681

Email: dgupta@carleton.edu

Fall Office Hours (by appointment, on Zoom)

Mondays, 2-4pm

Tuesdays, 6-8pm

Wednesdays, 11-2pm

Other days by prior arrangement

Course Overview

This course explores the emergence and resolution of separatist movements around the world—those groups of individuals who reject their continued membership in an existing sovereign state and instead claim the right to govern themselves. While we will be expansive in our focus, considering classic secessionist movements alongside movements for greater autonomy as well as irredentist movements, we will only investigate the dynamics of movements that have, at their core, some claim about political sovereignty. This excludes from our consideration groups that wish to withdraw from wider society or specific social/cultural/religious institutions, but that do not make any larger arguments about political sovereignty.

We will investigate the conditions under which separatist pressures are most likely to develop and when such pressures result in actual separation. We will contrast the tactics of movements, from peaceful approaches in places like contemporary Quebec or Scotland, to violent insurrections in places like the Chechnya and Northern Ireland. Along the way, we will consider the ethical and legal arguments for and against secession as well as consider cases where separatist tendencies lead to accommodation within the national state rather than independence from it.

Required Texts

There are no textbooks to purchase for this class (hooray!). Instead, all of the readings, videos, and other class materials will be posted on Moodle. You are expected to do all the required readings before coming to class.

Course Requirements

Your grade in this class will be based on the following five elements:

Participation	15%
Reading responses	10%
Midterm exam	20%
Case study journal	30%
Final paper	25%

Participation (15%)

Even though this is a 200-level class, I plan to run it as a discussion-intensive class with more of a seminar feel to it. This means there will be limited lecturing during our Zoom meetings. Much of the content that I would normally deliver during initial framing comments will be available asynchronously, for you to work through offline. This will free up our Zoom meetings for more discussion, in large and small groups. Given this plan, it will be vital that you come to class having done all the readings carefully and critically and being prepared to engage in thoughtful

conversation about the material. I envision learning in this seminar to involve shared, collaborative discovery; that is to say, learning not just from the professor, but also from your peers. The participation component of your grade requires two things from you: (1) active contribution to the discussion and (2) active engagement with/listening to the ideas of others.

Active contribution can happen in multiple forms for this class: speaking up in large and small group discussions (with multiple roles possible – asking or answering questions, summarizing the points that others make, taking notes and reporting back on small group discussions, taking a lead in soliciting ideas and input from others, bringing up examples, providing counterarguments or interpretations, etc.). It can also take the form of contribution to some of the asynchronous discussion opportunities, if live discussion does not play to your strengths. **The key here is to share your thoughts with others in the class, which is an act of intellectual generosity.**

Active engagement requires you to do more than passively listen to others. It means tracking the conversation actively, being respectful and open to the views of others, and giving the class your undivided attention. This will be far harder to do when in an online class because it is so easy to have other windows open and let your mind wander to other things (email, social media, online shopping, reading news – I have done all of the same in Zoom meetings, and I know you have too). **I ask you to make a good-faith effort here; close other windows and focus intensively on the class for 100 minutes.** But if I sense people are starting to disconnect from the class, I will start calling randomly on people – but as I generally don't like to do so, I will hold this in reserve unless I see evidence that people are not fully present and giving their attention to the class discussion.

So that you are not surprised by your participation score at the end of the term, you will get your grade in three “installments” – at the end of Week 3, Week 6, and the end of the term (worth 5% each). This will allow you to make any course corrections that you feel are necessary to improve your grade.

Reading responses (10%)

You will be responsible for turning in two reading responses, worth 5% each, during the term. These are short papers (2-3 double-spaced pages) that focus on one of the assigned readings for the class. In the paper, which is due **by noon** on the day the reading is assigned, you will (a) briefly summarize the main arguments of the paper, (b) provide your own analysis of the piece, pointing out what you think are strengths and weaknesses of the argument and/or the empirical evidence, and (c) articulate 1-2 questions that this piece raises for you—questions that can focus narrowly on the piece itself, or that compare the arguments of the piece with other content/readings we have encountered, or that ask larger theoretical/empirical/normative questions related to the themes of the class. You will sign up for your two reading responses in advance; you should schedule one of these response papers for the first half of the term and one for the second half of the term. Sign-ups will open in Week 2.

Midterm (20%)

The midterm will be a take-home essay exam. It is open note/open book, but it will not require you to do any outside research. You will receive a list of prompts, from which you will select two and respond, using the class texts to inform and support your analysis. The two essay responses will, combined, total 8-10 double-spaced pages and be due one week after receiving the prompts.

Case study journal (30%)

You will select a separatist movement — historical or contemporary — that you will investigate more closely over the course of the term using periodic, guided journal entries. There will be six entries total, each worth 5% of your grade. I will post several prompts each week, starting at the end of the 2nd week; you will pick one from each set and write a response of no more than 750 words, submitted within one week. A list of eligible separatist movements will be posted on Moodle. If you are interested in a movement that is **not** on the list, please see me and I will approve alternatives on a case-by-case basis. You are expected to do outside research on your chosen

case to inform your journal entries, which should also draw on class texts where appropriate and which should always include a bibliography (not counted in the word limit)

Final Paper (25%)

You will have the option of either writing a mini-research paper on a topic of your choosing, or a take-home final exam; regardless of your choice, the final paper will be 12-15 double-spaced pages. In order to be eligible for the paper option, you must discuss your proposed topic with me — and receive the green light to proceed — before the end of the 7th week. Anyone who does not have a cleared topic for the paper by this date must do the take-home final exam, which will be handed out on the last day of class. The final exam will require you to answer two prompts—one that is required of everyone doing the exam, and one that you will select from a set of provided options. The take home will draw on class readings and discussions. Both the paper and the final exam are **due by 9:30pm on the last day of the exam period.**

Course Policies

Course policies are detailed on the course Moodle page. It is your responsibility to read and familiarize yourself with their contents, especially the sections having to do with pandemic-related policies and procedures for this term.

Schedule of Readings

While most of the readings for this class come from scholarly sources, they will vary considerably in terms of their accessibility. Some will be pretty easy and straightforward; others may be tougher going and methodologically/theoretically complex. Regardless, it is your responsibility to engage seriously with each one, distilling the key arguments made by the authors and the evidence they present to support their arguments. Note: all readings are due for the date on which they are assigned, unless otherwise noted.

The following schedule is subject to revision/rearrangement, pending possible guest speakers.

Foundational concepts

Date	Topic	Readings and Assignments
Tuesday, September 15	Introduction to the course	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No reading. Familiarize yourself with this syllabus, particularly the assignments and course policies, as well as the class Moodle page.
Thursday, September 17	Secession and the international state system	<p>WATCH:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The background lecture on states and the international system. <p>READ:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Brubaker, Rogers. 2011. "National Homogenization and Ethnic Reproduction on the European Periphery." Pp. 21-43 in <i>Europe, Minorities, Religious Freedom</i>. Paris: L'Harmattan. Conversi, Daniele. 2008. "'We Are All Equals!' Militarism, Homogenization, and 'Egalitarianism' in Nationalist State-Building (1789-1945)." <i>Ethnic and Racial Studies</i>, 31(7): 1286-1314. Maja-Pearce, Adewale. 2018. "Prospects for Ambazonia." <i>London Review of Books</i>, 40(2), 25 October. <p>DO:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Consult the reading guide posted on Moodle to help focus on key ideas that will help facilitate the Zoom class discussion

What makes regions want to secede? A look at selective case studies

<p>Tuesday, September 22</p>	<p>Political grievances: Scotland and South Sudan</p>	<p>READ:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • King, Charles. 2012. "The Scottish Play: Edinburgh's Quest for Independence and the Future of Separatism." <i>Foreign Affairs</i>, 91(5): 113-124. • Dardanelli, Paolo and James Mitchell. 2014. "An Independent Scotland? The Scottish National Party's Bid for Independence and its Prospects." <i>The International Spectator</i>, 49(3): 88-105. • Vhumbunu, Clayton Hazvinei. 2018. "Reflecting on the Root Causes of South Sudan Secession: What Can Other African Leaders Learn?" <i>Journal for Contemporary History</i>, 43(2): 134-159. • Medani, Khalid Mustafa. 2011. "Strife and Secession in Sudan." <i>Journal of Democracy</i>, 22(3): 135-149. <p>DO:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Post at least twice on the Moodle forum before class. <p>Remember to sign up for your two reading response papers</p>
<p>Thursday, September 24</p>	<p>Cultural grievances: Sri Lanka and Hawaii</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meller, Norman and Anne Feder Lee. 1997. "Hawaiian Sovereignty." <i>Publius: The Journal of Federalism</i>, 27(2): 167-185. • Kauanui, J. Kēhaulani. 2005. "The Multiplicity of Hawaiian Sovereignty Claims and the Struggle for Meaningful Autonomy." <i>Comparative American Studies</i>, 3(3): 283-299. • Pfaffenberger, Bryan. 1981. "The Cultural Dimension of Tamil Separatism in Sri Lanka." <i>Asian Survey</i>, 21(11): 1145-1157. • Kearney, Robert N. 1978. "Language and the Rise of Tamil Separatism in Sri Lanka." <i>Asian Survey</i>, 18(5): 521-533. <p>DO:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Post at least twice on the Moodle forum before class. <p>Case study #1 prompts posted</p>
<p>Tuesday, September 29</p>	<p>Economic grievances: Greenland and Catalonia</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dowling, Andrew. 2014. "Accounting for the Turn Towards Secession in Catalonia." <i>International Journal of Iberian Studies</i>, 27(2-3): 219-234. • Boylan, Brandon M. 2015. "In Pursuit of Independence: The Political Economy of Catalonia's Secessionist Movement." <i>Nations and Nationalism</i>, 21(4): 761-785. • Rosen, Julia. 2016. "Arctic Dreams." <i>Nature</i>, 532(7599): 296-299. • Grydehøj, Adam. 2020. "Unravelling Economic Dependence and Independence in Relation to Island Sovereignty: The Case of Kalaallit Nunaat (Greenland)." <i>Island Studies Journal</i>, 15(1): 89-112. <p>DO:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Post at least twice on the Moodle forum before class.

When are secessionist claims deemed valid?

Thursday, October 1	Moral considerations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Buchanan, Allen. 1991. "Toward a Theory of Secession." <i>Ethics</i>, 101(2): 322-342 • Philpott, Daniel. 1995. "In Defense of Self-Determination." <i>Ethics</i>, 105(2): 352-385. <p>Case study #2 prompts posted</p>
Tuesday, October 6	Legal considerations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Crawford, James. 1999. "State Practice and International Law in Relation to Secession." <i>British Year Book of International Law</i>, 69(1): 85-117. • Sunstein, Cass R. 1991. "Constitutionalism and Secession," <i>The University of Chicago Law Review</i>, 58(2): 633-670. • Shorten, Andrew. 2013. "Constitutional Secession Rights, Exit Threats, and Multinational Democracy." <i>Political Studies</i>, 62(1): 99-115. <p>Do:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Read the short case study on Moodle and then weigh in on the debate on whether it constitutes a defensible secession, according to ethical and/or legal principles we have discussed in class. Your responses should be completed by the end of the week (Sunday).
Thursday, October 8	Political considerations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hechter, Michael. 1992. "The Dynamics of Secession." <i>Acta Sociologica</i>, 35(4): 267-283. • Young, Robert A. 1994. "How Do Peaceful Secessions Happen?" <i>Canadian Journal of Political Science</i>, 27(4): 773-792. • Qvortrup, Matt. 2014. "Referendums on Independence, 1860-2011." <i>The Political Quarterly</i>, 85(1): 57-64. <p>Case study #3 prompts posted</p>

What factors affect secessionist dynamics?

Tuesday, October 13	Economic factors	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Horowitz, Donald L. 1981. "Patterns of Ethnic Separatism." <i>Comparative Studies in Society and History</i>, 23(2): 165-195. • Collier, Paul and Anke Hoeffler. 2006. "The Political Economy of Secession." Pp. 37-60 in <i>Negotiating Self-Determination</i>, Hurst Hannum and Eileen F. Babbitt, eds. Lanham, MD: Lexington. • Tadjoeeddin, Mohammed Zulfan. 2011. "The Economic Origins of Indonesia's Secessionist Conflicts." <i>Civil Wars</i>, 13(3): 312-322.
Thursday, October 15	Political factors	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ayoade, John A.A. 1973. "Secession Threat as a Redressive Mechanism in Nigerian Federalism." <i>Publius</i>, 3(1): 57-74. • Walter, Barbara. 2006. "Information, Uncertainty, and the Decision to Secede." <i>International Organization</i>, 60(1): 105-135. • Englebort, Pierre and Rebecca Hummel. 2005. "Let's Stick Together: Understanding Africa's Secessionist Deficit." <i>African Affairs</i>, 104(416): 399-427. <p>Midterm exam handed out in class</p>

Tuesday, October 20	Cultural and security factors	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bartkus, Viva Ona. 2004. <i>The Dynamic of Secession</i>. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, ch. 5, 7 • Toor, Saadia. 2009. "Containing East Bengal: Language, Nation, and State Formation in Pakistan, 1947-1952." <i>Cultural Dynamics</i>, 21(2): 185-210.
Thursday, October 22	No reading!	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In-class movie and discussion <p>Midterm exam due on Moodle by 7pm Case study #4 prompts posted</p>
Tuesday, October 27	Diasporas and homelands	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Koinova, Maria. 2011. "Diasporas and Secessionist Conflicts: The Mobilization of the Armenian, Albanian, and Chechen Diasporas." <i>Ethnic and Racial Studies</i>, 34(2): 333-356. • Orjuela, Camilla. 2008. "Distant Warriors, Distant Peace Workers? Multiple Diaspora Roles in Sri Lanka's Violent Conflict." <i>Global Networks</i>, 8(4): 436-452. • Nagle, John. 2013. "Does Having a Kin State Lessen the Likelihood of Minorities Engaging in Secessionist Mobilization? An Analysis of the Moderating Influence of Kin States." <i>Nationalism and Ethnic Politics</i>, 19: 287-309.
Thursday, October 29	Violent vs. nonviolent struggles	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cunningham, Kathleen Gallagher. 2013. "Understanding Strategic Choice: The Determinants of Civil War and Nonviolent Campaign in Self-Determination Disputes." <i>Journal of Peace Research</i>, 50(3): 291-304. • Dutter, Lee E. 2011. "Why Don't Dogs Bark (or Bomb) in the Night? Explaining the Non-Development of Political Violence or Terrorism: The Case of Quebec Separatism." <i>Studies in Conflict and Terrorism</i>, 35(1): 59-75. • Griffiths, Ryan D. and Louis M. Wasser. 2019. "Does Violent Secessionism Work?" <i>Journal of Conflict Resolution</i>, 63(5): 1310-1336. <p>Case study #5 prompts posted If you wish to write an original final paper, the deadline for clearing your topic with me is tomorrow (Friday, October 30)</p>

Responses and Legacies of Secession

Tuesday, November 3	Alternatives to secession	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Kymlicka, Will. 1998. "Is Federalism a Viable Alternative to Secession?" pp. 109-147 in <i>Theories of Secession</i>, Percy B. Lehning, ed. London and New York: Routledge. • Ghai, Yash and Anthony J. Regan. 2006. "Unitary State, Devolution, Autonomy, Secession: State Building and Nation Building in Bougainville, Papua New Guinea." <i>The Round Table</i>, 95(386): 589-608. • Levy, Jacob T. 2003 "Indigenous Self-Government." Pp. 116-130 in <i>Secession and Self-Determination</i>, Stephen Macedo and Allen Buchanan, eds. New York and London: New York University Press.
------------------------	---------------------------	--

Thursday, November 5	State responses	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ker-Lindsay, James. 2014. "Understanding State Responses to Secession." <i>Peacebuilding</i>, 2(1): 28-44. • Lustick, Ian, Dan Miodownik, and Roy J. Eidelson. 2004. "Secessionism in Multicultural States: Does Sharing Power Prevent or Encourage It?" <i>American Political Science Review</i>, 98(2): 209-229. • Norman, Wayne. 2003. "Domesticating Secession." Pp. 180-220 in <i>Secession and Self-Determination</i>, Stephen Macedo and Allen Buchanan, eds. New York and London: New York University Press. <p>Case study #6 prompts posted</p>
Tuesday, November 10	International responses	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Saideman, Stephen M. "The International Relations of Secession." Pp. 267-280 in <i>The Ashgate Research Companion to Secession</i>, Aleksander Pavkovic and Peter Radan, eds. Farnham, UK and Burlington, VT: Ashgate. • Heraclides, Alexis. 1990. "Secessionist Minorities and External Involvement." <i>International Organization</i>, 44(3): 341-378. • Kemoklidze, Nino. 2009. "The Kosovo Precedent and the Moral Hazard of Secession." <i>Journal of International Law and International Relations</i>, 5(2): 117-140.
Thursday, November 12	Consequences of secession	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dion, Stephane. 1996. "Why is Secession Difficult in Well-Established Democracies?" Lessons from Quebec." <i>British Journal of Political Science</i>, 26(2): 269-283. • Forsberg, Erika. 2013. "Do Ethnic Dominoes Fall? Evaluating Domino Effects of Granting Territorial Concessions to Separatist Groups." <i>International Studies Quarterly</i>, 57(2): 329-340.
Tuesday, November 17	Post-secession challenges	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tir, Jaroslav. 2005. "Keeping the Peace After Secession: Territorial Conflicts between Rump and Secessionist States." <i>Journal of Conflict Resolution</i>, 49(5): 713-741. • Bookman, Milica Zarkovic. 1992. <i>The Economics of Secession</i>. London: Palgrave Macmillan, ch. 6-7. • Belloni, Roberto. 2011. "The Birth of South Sudan and the Challenges of Statebuilding." <i>Ethnopolitics</i>, 10(3): 411-429. <p>Prompts for final paper handed out</p>